

## Corporate Social Responsibility & Governance Accountability Review

This is the release of CPRI's research on corporate social responsibility & governance accountability review, with a focus on human rights, executive pay and (dis)qualification of board directors. Many companies added environmental factor to their CSR reports, but it is not comparable or fair among energy, manufacturing and software companies, and I noticed some companies inserting this factor to dilute social concerns. At this stage, I include these companies (1 in Japan, 6 in China and the rest in the U.S.) based on my personal knowledge and field study since as early as 1992 when I started to work in Japan. The hundreds documents/articles in English and Chinese in the foot notes extensively show how I reach to conclusion for each company's CSR. Being a trained Sociologist on social research, I am fully aware of the methodology constrain of this project. Nonetheless, it provides an alternative perspective among so many reviews on how to gauge corporate social responsibility in the age of globalization, which has greatly been driven by these international companies under review.

A: 80-100, leader

B: 60-80, good citizen

C: 40-60, average effort

D: 20-40, concerned, need improvement

F: 0-20, failure, unethical, unlawful

Jing Zhao, Ph. D

US-Japan-China Comparative Policy Research Institute

November 8, 2012 [V.1]

March 21, 2013 [V.2]

March 4, 2014 [V.3]

January 1, 2015 [V.4]

January 1, 2016 [V.5], August 26, 2016

January 1, 2017 [V.6]

January 1, 2018 [V.7]

- A Google<sup>1</sup>  
A- Intel<sup>2</sup>  
B+ Chevron<sup>3</sup>  
B- HP<sup>4</sup>, Microsoft<sup>5</sup>, Cisco<sup>6</sup>, facebook<sup>7</sup>, Symantec<sup>8</sup>, Wells Fargo<sup>9</sup>  
C+ Dentsu group<sup>10</sup>, Adobe Systems<sup>11</sup>, Best Buy<sup>12</sup>, Boeing<sup>13</sup>, Tesla Motors<sup>14</sup>, Gilead<sup>15</sup>, Wal-Mart Stores<sup>16</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2008/google.html> . There are three documents on Google at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr13.html> , seven documents on Google at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr14.html> including the final review in Chinese at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2010/google2010.html>

<sup>2</sup> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/Intel\\_csr.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/Intel_csr.pdf) , [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/ict\\_freedom.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/ict_freedom.pdf) , [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/to\\_intell10921.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/to_intell10921.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2008/chevron.pdf> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2009/chevron2009.pdf> . There are five documents on Chevron at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr14.html> including the final review in Chinese at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2010/chevron100201.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr14.html> . <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/hp111010.pdf> , [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/occupy\\_HP.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/occupy_HP.pdf) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/hp120912.pdf> , <http://cn.nytimes.com/article/business/2013/02/08/c08hewlett/en/> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/hp-policy.pdf> , [http://media.corporate-ir.net/media\\_files/irol/71/71087/proxy2013/HTML2/default.htm](http://media.corporate-ir.net/media_files/irol/71/71087/proxy2013/HTML2/default.htm) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/hp-shareholders-meeting.pdf> , and more files at the link <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr17.html>

<sup>5</sup> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/MS\\_Shareholders.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/MS_Shareholders.pdf) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/microsoft2013.pdf>

<sup>6</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2008/cisco.pdf> . There are fourteen documents on Cisco at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr14.html> including five documents in Chinese. [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/proposal\\_to\\_Cisco\\_2014.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/proposal_to_Cisco_2014.pdf) , [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/cisco\\_2014.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/cisco_2014.pdf) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/cisco2015.pdf>

<sup>7</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/g2.pdf> , [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/fb\\_proposal\\_2016.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/fb_proposal_2016.pdf) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/fbproxy2016.pdf> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/facebook2016.pdf>

<sup>8</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/symantec.pdf> , [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/symantec\\_shareholder\\_proposal\\_2015.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/symantec_shareholder_proposal_2015.pdf) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/symc2015.pdf> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/symantec2015.pdf>

<sup>9</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2017/wf2018.pdf>

<sup>10</sup> I worked for two Dentsu group companies 1992-95. <http://www.dentsu.com/csr/>

<sup>11</sup> I worked in Adobe 2000-2001 as a Quality Engineer. <http://www.adobe.com/corporate-responsibility/reports.html>

<sup>12</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/bestbuy.pdf> Note: after further communications with Best Buy, I upgraded its CSRI from C to C+.

<sup>13</sup> There are six documents on Boeing at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr14.html> including the final review in Chinese at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2010/boeing.pdf>

<sup>14</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/tesla-netflix2015.pdf> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/tesla.pdf>

<sup>15</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/gilead.pdf>

<sup>16</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/walmart160509.pdf> , [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/walmart\\_proposal\\_2017.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/walmart_proposal_2017.pdf) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/walmart.pdf>

C Applied Materials<sup>17</sup>, eBay<sup>18</sup>, China Digital TV<sup>19</sup>, JDS Uniphase<sup>20</sup>, Sun Microsystems<sup>21</sup>, Brocade Communications<sup>22</sup>, Visa<sup>23</sup>, PG&E<sup>24</sup>, SunEdsion<sup>25</sup>, Hoapira<sup>26</sup>, Altera<sup>27</sup>, Hospira<sup>28</sup>, Ellie Mae<sup>29</sup>, Verizon Communications<sup>30</sup>, Clorox<sup>31</sup>, Nuance<sup>32</sup>, salesforce<sup>33</sup>

C- Goldman Sachs<sup>34</sup>, China Southern Airlines<sup>35</sup>, Juniper Networks<sup>36</sup>, Oracle<sup>37</sup>, NetApp<sup>38</sup>, Sandisk<sup>39</sup>, IBM<sup>40</sup>, JPMorgan Chase<sup>41</sup>, Twitter<sup>42</sup>, Exxon Mobil<sup>43</sup>, Sohu<sup>44</sup>,

---

<sup>17</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2003/stock.pdf> , <http://www.appliedmaterials.com/about/cr> ,  
<http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/applied.pdf> , [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/amat\\_proposal\\_2017.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/amat_proposal_2017.pdf)

<sup>18</sup> [http://www.ebayinc.com/social\\_innovation](http://www.ebayinc.com/social_innovation) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/ebay.pdf> . I also attended its shareholders meeting and users' event one time each.

<sup>19</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2008/stv.html>

<sup>20</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2008/jdsu.html>

<sup>21</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2008/sun.html> (acquired by Oracle in 2010)

<sup>22</sup> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/Brocade\\_Zhao\\_20110513.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/Brocade_Zhao_20110513.pdf) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/brocade.pdf>

<sup>23</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/visa.pdf>

<sup>24</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/pge.pdf>

<sup>25</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/memc.pdf>

<sup>26</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/hospira.pdf>

<sup>27</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/altera.pdf>

<sup>28</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/hospira.pdf>

<sup>29</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/elliemae.pdf>

<sup>30</sup> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/verizon\\_proposal\\_2017.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/verizon_proposal_2017.pdf) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/verizon2017.pdf>,  
<http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2017/proxy-vz.pdf>

<sup>31</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/clorox.pdf>

<sup>32</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2017/nuance.pdf>

<sup>33</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2017/salesforce.pdf>

<sup>34</sup> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/Letter\\_to\\_GS\\_20120521.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/Letter_to_GS_20120521.pdf)

[http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/proposal2013\\_to\\_GS.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/proposal2013_to_GS.pdf) <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/gs-policy.pdf>

[http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/gs\\_sec.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/gs_sec.pdf) <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/zhao121228.pdf>

<http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/SEC130308.pdf> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/gs\\_statement.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/gs_statement.pdf) , and more at

<http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr17.html> and <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr18.html> ,

[http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/gs\\_shareholder\\_proposal\\_2015.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/gs_shareholder_proposal_2015.pdf) ,

[http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/gs\\_proposal\\_2016.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/gs_proposal_2016.pdf)

<sup>35</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2009/chinasouthernairlines.pdf>

<sup>36</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/juniper.pdf>

<sup>37</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2008/oracle.html> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/oracle.pdf>

<sup>38</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/netapp.pdf> , [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/netapp\\_proposal\\_2014.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/netapp_proposal_2014.pdf)

<sup>39</sup> Sandisk did not answer my shareholder letter of human rights concern.

<sup>40</sup> Three documents at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr18.html> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/Zhao-SEC-IBM.pdf>,

<http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/SEC-IBM.pdf> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/IBM-2015-Proxy-Statement.pdf> ,

<http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/ibm-abe.pdf>

<sup>41</sup> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/jpm\\_shareholder\\_proposal\\_2015.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/jpm_shareholder_proposal_2015.pdf) ,

[http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/jpm\\_proposal\\_2016.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/jpm_proposal_2016.pdf) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/SEC-JPM.pdf> ,

<http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/proposal9.pdf> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/jpm2016.pdf>

Netflix<sup>45</sup>, American Express<sup>46</sup>

D+ News<sup>47</sup>, Apple<sup>48</sup>, PetroChina<sup>49</sup>, RadioShack<sup>50</sup>, Zynga<sup>51</sup>, Sina<sup>52</sup>, Alibaba<sup>53</sup>, Altaba<sup>54</sup>

D Baidu<sup>55</sup>

F Yahoo<sup>56</sup>

---

<sup>42</sup> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/twitter\\_proposal\\_2016.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/twitter_proposal_2016.pdf)

<sup>43</sup> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/exxon\\_proposal\\_2016.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/exxon_proposal_2016.pdf)

<sup>44</sup> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/Letter\\_to\\_sohu\\_20120521.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/Letter_to_sohu_20120521.pdf) and more files at the link <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr18.html> , [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/sohu\\_proposal\\_2015.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/sohu_proposal_2015.pdf) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/form8k.pdf>

<sup>45</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/netflix.pdf> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/tesla-netflix2015.pdf> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/netflix2016.pdf>

<sup>46</sup> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/axp\\_proposal\\_2017.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/axp_proposal_2017.pdf)

<sup>47</sup> There are five documents on News Corp. at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr14.html> . [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/News\\_letter.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/News_letter.pdf) , [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/News\\_scandal.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2011/News_scandal.pdf)

<sup>48</sup> <http://www.apple.com/supplierresponsibility/> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/letter\\_to\\_apple2013.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/letter_to_apple2013.pdf) <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/apple-policy.pdf> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/to\\_gore.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2013/to_gore.pdf) , three documents of 2015 shareholder proposal: <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr18.html> ,

[http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/apple\\_proposal\\_2016.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/apple_proposal_2016.pdf) ,

[http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/apple\\_proposal\\_2017.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/apple_proposal_2017.pdf) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/zhao-sec-apple.pdf> ,

<http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/sec-apple.pdf> ,

[http://fortune.com/2016/11/01/sec-says-apple-must-allow-investors-to-vote-on-executive-pay-probe/?xid=for\\_fb\\_sh](http://fortune.com/2016/11/01/sec-says-apple-must-allow-investors-to-vote-on-executive-pay-probe/?xid=for_fb_sh) , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2016/apple-board.pdf> ,

<https://www.mccarter.com/files/Uploads/Documents/Shareholder%20Challenges%20Apple%20Pay%20Practice.pdf>

<sup>49</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2008/petro.pdf>

<sup>50</sup> [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/Zhao\\_RadioShack120516.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/Zhao_RadioShack120516.pdf)

<sup>51</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/csri-chinese.pdf>

<sup>52</sup> I visited Sina when it started in Silicon Valley in 1999, have been its shareholder, and have used its blog and weibo services after it moved to China.

<sup>53</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2015/alibaba.pdf>

<sup>54</sup> <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2017/yahoofund2017.pdf> Anyuan

<sup>55</sup> I have been its shareholder. It never replied my letters.

<sup>56</sup> 17 documents in 2007 at <http://cpri.tripod.com/yahoo.html> , <http://www.epochtimes.com/gb/7/6/11/n1739900.htm> , 8 documents in 2008 at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr12.html> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2009/yahoo2009.html> , 5 documents in 2010 at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr14.html> , 9 documents in 2011 at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr15.html> ,

[http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/yahoo\\_220\\_complaint.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/yahoo_220_complaint.pdf) ,

[http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/yahoo\\_proposal\\_2012.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/yahoo_proposal_2012.pdf) , [http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/zhao\\_sec.pdf](http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2012/zhao_sec.pdf) , 6

documents in 2013 at <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr17.html> , <http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr2014/mak.html> , 7 documents (including proposals to Wal-Mart Stores and Verizon Communications ) in 2016 at

<http://cpri.tripod.com/cpr20.html> ,

<https://chinachange.org/2016/04/28/statement-by-seven-former-chinese-political-prisoners-regarding-the-death-of-harry-wu-and-the-abuses-of-the-yahoo-human-rights-fund/> ,

<https://foreignpolicy.com/2016/05/25/the-complicated-and-contradictory-life-of-harry-wu-china-yahoo/> ,

<http://www.nytimes.com/2016/08/14/us/champion-of-human-rights-in-china-leaves-a-tarnished-legacy.html> .



[Updates]

March 21, 2013: downgraded Apple from C- to D+; downgraded Goldman Sachs from C to C-; upgraded HP from C+ to B-.

March 4, 2014: added B-: facebook, C: PG&E, SunEdison; added more research to HP, Goldman Sachs, Sohu, Microsoft, NetApp, and Yahoo, with more contents on international peace.

January 1, 2015: added C: Hospira, Altera, Hospira, Netflix; C-: IBM; added more research on eBay, Goldman Sachs, Sohu, NetApp, Applied Materials, Brocade Communications, Cisco, Symantec; changed “Corporate Social Responsibility Index” to ” Corporate Social Responsibility Review”.

January 1, 2016: added C-: JPMorgan Chase, Twitter, Exxon Mobil; added C+: Tesla Motors; added D+: Alibaba; changed Symantec from C- to B-; changed Sohu from D to C-; changed Netflix from C to C-; changed News from F to D; added more research on Goldman Sachs, IBM, Cisco, Apple, facebook.

May 11, 2016: added C+: Gilead; changed Baidu from D+ to D; changed News from D to D+.

January 1, 2017: added C+: Wal-Mart Stores; added C: Verizon Communications, Clorox; added C-: American Express; changed title from “US-Japan-China Comparative Policy Research Institute (CPRI) Corporate Social Responsibility Review (CSRR)” to “Corporate Social Responsibility & Governance Accountability Review”.

January 1, 2018: added B-: Wells Fargo; C: Nuance, salesforce; D+: Albata.